

## FINAL NARRATIVE REPORT

### 1. Executive Summary of the Action

*Please give a global overview of the Action's implementation for the reporting period (no more than ½ page).*

The reporting period covers the activities implemented within the framework of the project according to the work plan - holding an informational seminar-training for stakeholders on GSP + with the participation of DRI representatives, recruitment of expert-consultants, identifying partner organizations for collecting information and preparation of alternative reports, conducting a population survey, analyzing international and national legislation in the sphere of labor relations and drafting of a Guidebook as a tool for CSOs to conduct monitoring, as well as holding informational and training activities to enhance the capacity of CSOs and civil activists on labor issues. The recommendations developed in collaboration with partner organizations were included in the Universal Periodic Review (UPR) from the civil sector for submission to the Human Rights Council. In addition, recommendations were developed and sent to the Secretariat of the Coordination Council for Human Rights under the Government of the Kyrgyz Republic for inclusion in the national report of the Kyrgyz Republic on the implementation of the provisions of the ICCPR.

Informational and communication events have been conducted, including bilateral meetings with representatives of state bodies, deputies of the Parliament of the Kyrgyz Republic, 2 Secretariats for the development of business and entrepreneurship - under the Government and the Parliament of the Kyrgyz Republic, as well as business community organizations. A Forum was organized and held with the participation of all interested parties to actualize issues related to GSP + and discuss draft alternative reports on the labor rights of women and children in Kyrgyzstan. As a result of the Forum a Resolution has been adopted with recommendations to the Government and the Parliament. Also, the Committee on International Affairs, Defense and Security of the Parliament of the Kyrgyz Republic established a working group to monitor the implementation by the Government of the Kyrgyz Republic of the Protocol on the accession of the Kyrgyz Republic to the Marrakesh Agreement on the formation of the World Trade Organization and to study ongoing work to stimulate the export of national products within the framework of the EU's GSP + trade preferences.

During the reporting period following communication materials have been developed and subsequently circulated in social media networks and media space - articles, social video-clips, infographics on GSP+ and the labor rights of women and children in the Kyrgyz Republic. A press-conference was held as a result of the work on development of alternative reports.

### 2. Political Update

*Please give a global overview of the situation in the Country, listing any event/news/legislative initiative relevant for the GSP+ and for human and labour rights.*

- In June 2018, a draft law of the Kyrgyz Republic “On Ensuring Equality” prepared by deputies of the Kyrgyz Parliament was submitted for public discussion<sup>1</sup>. The draft law was developed in accordance with international standards and recommendations in the field of protection of the rights and freedoms of a person and citizen, in order to ensure equality by preventing, combating and eliminating all forms of discrimination from state bodies, local authorities, legal entities and individuals. The bill defines bodies with the authority to prevent, combat and eliminate all forms of discrimination, and to ensure equality; it contains a definition of the term “discrimination”, an

---

<sup>1</sup> <http://www.kenesh.kg/ru/article/show/4046/na-obshtestvennoe-obsuzhdenie-s-28-iyunya-2018-goda-vinositsya-proekt-zakona-kirgizskoy-respubliki-ob-obespechenii-ravenstva>.

expanded list of signs of discrimination and its forms, has a list of social groups protected by law. Unfortunately, today there is no additional information on the website of the Kyrgyz Parliament on further promotion of the bill.

- In April 2019, there were initiatives from the deputies of the Kyrgyz Parliament to amend the Law of the Kyrgyz Republic “On Labour Unions”. On June 10, 2019, the draft law was approved by the relevant committee of the Parliament in the first reading; on October 3, 2019, the Parliament adopted it in the second reading. The bill, as stated by representatives of the labor union movement of Kyrgyzstan, as well as individual independent experts and representatives of CSOs, encroaches on the constitutional foundations of human freedom in violation of international labor norms and standards. The bill is considered to be unconstitutional. Representatives of labor union organizations, together with civic activists and CSOs, held rallies against the adoption of the draft law in the proposed version. To date, a commission has been created consisting of representatives of the deputies, labor union organizations and independent experts to consider proposed changes for compliance with the Constitution of the Kyrgyz Republic and international standards.
- In August 2019, according to the order of the Government No. 297-r on protection of the rights of business entities of the Kyrgyz Republic, the Business Ombudsman (Robin Ord-Smith) was appointed. In early October 2019, deputies of the Business Ombudsman of the Kyrgyz Republic were appointed. The main goal of the Institute of Business Ombudsman is to ensure guarantees of state protection of the rights and legitimate interests of entrepreneurs and their observance by state authorities, local authorities, institutions and state enterprises and officials.
- On September 17, 2019, the Committee on International Affairs, Defense and Security of the Parliament of the Kyrgyz Republic established a working group to monitor the implementation by the Government of the Kyrgyz Republic of the Protocol on the accession of the Kyrgyz Republic to the Marrakesh Agreement on the formation of the World Trade Organization and the study of ongoing work to stimulate the export of national products within the framework of GSP + trade preferences. This step demonstrates increased interest on the part of representatives of the deputies about the opportunities and obligations of the Kyrgyz Republic within the framework of the GSP + status.

### 3. Activities

In general, description of the activities should include:

#### **Activity 1. Information Seminar**

On February 15, 2019, in the Golden Tulip Hotel was hosted an informational training-seminar on the topic: “GSP + in Kyrgyzstan: Prospects for Business and Human Rights”. The event was attended by representatives of government agencies, the business community and CSOs. The aim of the event was to show, that, GSP + covers 27 conventions on human rights, has the potential to engage in the discussion of a wide range of civil society organizations, businesses and the respective profile government bodies. GSP + can be an effective tool to advance the implementation of the provisions of 27 human rights conventions, as well as a means to achieve greater economic growth in the country. The event was attended by representatives of a donor organization ( DRI ). As a result of the seminar, a working group was created in order to exchange information and discuss current issues, as well as their promotion in public space.

## **Activity 2. Collection and information analysis**

At the beginning of the project an open competition was announced to recruit for the position of an expert in the framework of implementation of the project activities, namely - to collect and analyse information on stated topics, to conduct analysis of national legislation for its compliance with international standards and to develop a Guidebook for CSOs as a tool to conduct monitoring of human rights (in our case, labor rights of women and children); to conduct informational and training events and prepare alternative reports. Based on the results of the competition, Dmitry Kabak was selected as an expert, and in December 2018 a contract was signed with him. In the process of implementation of the project, some difficulties appeared on the part of the expert Kabak, which affected the deadlines for completing tasks assigned to him. In this regard, it was decided to engage a second expert in the project. In June 2019, a competition was announced and on the results of the second open competition, Hurnisa Makhaddinova was selected as a second expert. In September 2019, expert Dmitry Kabak left the project, and due to this and limited time to prepare alternative reports, by the decision of the Coalition's management, an additional expert, Asylgul Balybaeva, who meets the requirements of the project to facilitate and prepare an alternative report, was selected from the Coalition's roster of experts. Asylgul Balybaeva began work in September 2019.

## **Activity 3. Survey**

In April - May 2019, a population survey was organized and conducted according to a pre-developed questionnaire to determine the opinions of citizens of Kyrgyzstan on the status of GSP + and respect for human rights. The survey was conducted by telephone interview with 1,600 respondents selected using quotas given by gender, age, and region. A sociologist consultant was hired to develop a questionnaire and analyze survey results, and operators were contracted to conduct the survey. The survey was conducted from May 3 to May 11, 2019, according to the results of the survey, a report was prepared, which was posted on the Coalition's website and social media networks. The survey results were included in the Guidebook on Monitoring and alternative reports. They were also used as statistical information during holding informational and training events.

## **Activity 4. Communication materials and activities**

In February 2019, as part of the previously announced open tender for the provision of SMM / PR project specialist services, Gulsina Ablasova was selected into the project for the position of SMM / PR specialist and worked on this position until the end of July 2019. In August 2019, a second competition for the provision of SMM / PR specialist services was announced, and in September 2019, Kunduzgul Tokubaeva was selected based on the results of the competition. SMM / PR project specialist participated in the preparation and publication of informational materials, articles, press releases.

During the project implementation period, tenders were also announced and companies / organizations selected for the provision of services for the production of various products: ( i ) media products – video-clip, video graphics, infographics; ( ii ) printing services for the production and printing of various informational, educational and communication materials. So, in the framework of this activity, together with selected companies, following concepts were developed and produced:

- 1 informational video-clip about GSP + (October 2019);
- 2 videographics (1 on the labor rights of women in the Kyrgyz Republic; 2nd on the labor rights of children in the Kyrgyz Republic; December 2019);
- 5 infographics (September-October 2019);
- project's booklet in Russian and Kyrgyz languages (June 2019);
- organized and held a press-conference on the results of development of alternative reports with the participation of representative of partner organization - Eldiyar Karachalov - chairman of the Youth

Council of the Federation of Labor Unions of the Kyrgyz Republic, the director of PF "Foundation for Support of labor initiatives" and a member of the Public Observation Council of the State Ecological Technical Inspection (30 January 2020).

All produced products, informational materials, articles were posted on the website and social media pages of the Coalition, sent to the working group and partner organizations.

### **Activity 5. Meetings with different stakeholders**

In April 2019, the project coordinator took part in a 2-day training (discussion) on the preparation of an alternative report (Universal Periodic Review). The working meeting was attended by representatives of civil society organizations from all regions of the country, who, together with invited experts (OHCHR), chose topics for the preparation of sections of the report. Subsequently, in the framework of cooperation with a partner organization that works in the field of promoting labor union organizations and labor issues in the Kyrgyz Republic, recommendations were identified and developed, 2 of which were included in the Universal Periodic Review (UPR) from the civil sector for submission to the Human Rights Council.

In May-June 2019, 2 working meetings were organized and held with representatives of NGOs in Bishkek in order to identify organizations for cooperation in the field of labor and ensuring the achievement of project objectives - identifying partner organizations in the Kyrgyz Republic as part of monitoring the observation of labor rights of women and children in the Kyrgyz Republic. In the following, these organizations (Child Protection Center PA, Center of Solidarity, the LEA NGO Association for the Promotion of the Rights and Interests of Children in the Kyrgyz Republic, Kyrgyz Indigo PA, and the Federation of Labour Unions of Kyrgyzstan) took part in development of alternative reports.

Working meetings have been organized and conducted with: ( i ) the head of the Secretariat of the Council for Business Development and Entrepreneurship under the Speaker of the Parliament (Business Kenesh) B. Degenbaev and his deputy A. Dooronbekova, as a result of which an agreement was concluded on participation of the Secretariat as a co-organizer of Forum; ( ii ) Chairman of the Council of the Chamber of Commerce and Industry of the Kyrgyz Republic, K. Kasymaliev, and (iii) Head of the Secretariat of the Council for Business Development and Investments under the Government of the Kyrgyz Republic, T. Koichumanov, in order to identify opportunities for cooperation. As a result of the meetings, the Secretariat of the Council for Business and Entrepreneurship Development under the Speaker of the Parliament (Business Kenesh) of the Kyrgyz Republic became the co-organizer of the Forum, the head of the Secretariat of the Council for Business Development and Investments under the Government of the Kyrgyz Republic T. Koichumanov – a moderator of the Forum.

Also, in November-December 2019, negotiations were held with the representative of the Parliament of the Kyrgyz Republic, the Chairman of the Committee on International Affairs, Defense, and Security of the Parliament of the Kyrgyz Republic - I. Pirmatov, who expressed his interest in the work of the Coalition and took part in the Forum on December 13, 2019.

### **Activity 6. Forum**

On December 13, 2019, the Forum was organized and held with participation of key stakeholders, such as government bodies, business communities and CSOs, where draft alternative reports on the rights of women and children in the field of labor relations were presented in the form of presentations. Also, the economic aspect of GSP+ scheme and problems faced by the business community were reviewed. The representative of the Ministry of Economics of the Kyrgyz Republic presented information on measures implemented by the state body within the framework of GSP+ scheme, statistical data and plans. It should

be noted that representatives of government agencies and business communities consider the GSP+ status as an economic tool, while they are not sufficiently informed about the obligations of the Kyrgyz Republic under 27 conventions. As a result of the Forum, a draft Resolution was developed with recommendations on both legal and economic aspects of the GSP+ scheme for subsequent submission to the Parliament of the Kyrgyz Republic and the Government of the Kyrgyz Republic. The strengthening of the system of control by the Government of the Kyrgyz Republic over the implementation of obligations under 27 international conventions was included as a recommendation in the Resolution, which is also a prerequisite for advancing the goals and objectives of the project. In January 2020, the Resolution, together with a cover letter, was sent to the Government and the Parliament of the Kyrgyz Republic.

In preparation for the Forum, the following activities were carried out: a) “A Guidebook to monitoring the observance of the rights of women and children in the field of labour relations in the framework of international and national legislation” was translated into Kyrgyz; b) separate presentations on the labour rights of women and children were prepared by the project experts; c) the Forum’s program was developed and agreed with the Secretariat; d) the design of handouts (folders, notebooks) has been developed. All materials were subsequently replicated in the printing house.

### **Activity 7. Trainings for CSOs on monitoring and development of a Guidebook**

As part of this activity, at the beginning an analysis of national legislation was carried out with a view to its compliance with international treaties in the field of protection of the rights of children and women in the context of labor (the activity was formulated as part of the Monitoring Strategy developed jointly with an external expert E. Patterson). The next step was the development by the expert of a Guidebook for CSOs, which includes detailed information on the norms, tools and mechanisms for protection of the rights of women and children in the field of labor relations in the framework of international and national laws. The main focus was on the fundamental ILO Conventions (( i ) Prohibition of Forced Labor - ILO Conventions (No. 29 and No. 105) and Protocol to ILO Convention No. 29; ( ii ) Equal Opportunities and Prohibition of Discrimination - ILO Conventions (No. 100 and No. 111); ( iii ) Child labor - ILO Conventions (No. 138 and No. 182.) Also, the provisions of other UN human rights documents were reviewed: ICCPR, ICESCR, CERD, CEDAW and the Convention on the Rights of the Child) and the incorporation of the norms of these Conventions into the national legislation. In particular, the Guidebook covers the monitoring of norms in two areas: ensuring equality and protection against discrimination in employment, protection of children from particularly harmful and dangerous working conditions. These rights have been the subject of the mentioned publication. The case-stories, provided by partners also were analyzed and included in the Guidebook as illustrative examples. The work on the development of a Guidebook was completed in July 2019, and replicated in the printing house.

2 round tables / seminars were held in Osh (July 11-12, two days) and Bishkek (August 7, one day) in order to raise awareness on the GSP + scheme in Kyrgyzstan and the country's obligations to respect human rights under international treaties. In particular, at the event were presented and discussed: ( i ) analysis of the national legislation on the rights of women and children in the field of labor relations (compliance with ILO and UN conventions on human rights); ( ii ) presentation of the results of a country-wide survey on the theme “Opinions of the citizens of Kyrgyzstan on the issues of GSP + and human rights”; and ( iii ) mechanisms for monitoring human rights, in the context of the rights of women and children in the field of labor relations. The events were attended by representatives of government bodies, business community, CSOs, experts and civic activists. The participants of the seminars improved their legal knowledge on the monitoring of labor rights, and as a visual aid they received the Guidebook for monitoring the observation of the rights of women and children in the field of labor relations in the framework of international and national legislation, developed in the framework of the project.

## **Activity 8. Alternative monitoring reports and information management system**

In September 2019, experts H.Makhaddinova and A. Balybaeva began to analyze the materials collected by Coalition on the rights of women and children in the field of labor relations. In the process of analyzing the information, it was decided to prepare two separate reports (previously agreed with DRI), because, although there is only one subject of analysis - labor relations, the beneficiaries are the 2 most vulnerable categories - children and women. In this regard, two separate draft alternative reports were prepared: i) on the labor rights of children in the Kyrgyz Republic; ii) on women's labor rights in the Kyrgyz Republic. For the preparation of the reports were used: (i) the results of a survey of the population; (ii) analysis of the national and international legislations; (iii) responses of the competent state authorities to the requests of the Coalition; (iv) open sources (various websites of government agencies, international organizations, NGOs and the media); (v) collecting information by distributing an online questionnaire to the expert community. This type of survey showed the absence of organizations in the Kyrgyz Republic that specialize in monitoring the labor rights of these beneficiaries. In particular, NGOs that work to protect the rights of children and women in Kyrgyzstan monitor the observance of the rights of beneficiaries in the framework of the "human rights" as a whole, without focusing on labor aspects.

On October 4, 2019, the drafts of two alternative reports were presented and discussed with the expert community in the framework of a focus group organized by the Coalition with participation of representatives of NGOs, the labor union organization, and government bodies. At the meeting, participants voiced the information on where, according to their observations, child labor is most often used (markets, seasonal field work, etc.), violations of women's labor rights occur, as well as the causes of their occurrence and consequences. The focus group participants jointly developed recommendations for inclusion in draft reports. Draft alternative reports were translated into English and sent to DRI for review and coordination.

Subsequently, from October 2019 to January 2020, draft reports were finalized taking into account the comments and recommendations of DRI and an external expert. They were also presented for discussion at the Forum, held on December 13, 2019. The final versions of the reports were handled to the printing house for the development of design, layout and replication. Electronic versions of reports were posted on the Coalition's website with their promotion on social media pages.

### **4. Analysis of Results and Impact So Far**

*Please take time to reflect on the project's results and impact so far, and provide some description and analysis of this impact. Use examples from during the reporting period if possible.*

- As noted in earlier reports, the Ministry of Economics, as an authorized body for the application of the GSP + scheme in Kyrgyzstan, is interested in the states' implementation of the economic component of the GSP + scheme, but at the same time does not have an authority on monitoring and execution of obligations under the norms of 27 international conventions. The government has not designated the responsible state body for the legal component of the GSP + scheme. In our opinion, the absence of a responsible state body for monitoring the implementation of obligations under the 27 conventions is a significant omission on the part of the Government, and impedes the promotion of the rights embodied in these 27 international conventions in the territory of the Kyrgyz Republic. Recommendations on strengthening the fulfillment of government obligations under the GSP +, including ensuring the protection of the labor rights of project beneficiaries, developed as part of the Forum and sent in the form of a Resolution to the Government and the Parliament of the Kyrgyz Republic, as well as those included in alternative reports, will help to provide favorable

impact on fulfillment by the state of obligations under GSP + and on promotion of the rights of beneficiaries.

- Actualization of issues of discrimination against women (for example, limiting employment, unequal pay for equal work) in the public space through various informational materials, articles, led to a discussion of the Decree of the Government of the Kyrgyz Republic №158 dated March 24, 2000, according to which the List of industries, jobs, professions and positions with harmful and/or dangerous working conditions in which women's labour is prohibited. The List includes 446 productions/professions/jobs/positions. Lists of professions prohibited for women are a legacy of the Soviet law and practice, and are currently valid in many countries of the former USSR. According to the information of the Ministry of Labor and Social Development of the Kyrgyz Republic, work is currently underway to revise the above Decree to reduce the list of industries, jobs, professions and positions included in the list. However, the list is generally discriminatory and must be completely canceled.
- As it was mentioned above, on September 17, 2019, the Committee on International Affairs, Defense, and Security of the Parliament of the Kyrgyz Republic established a working group to monitor the implementation by the Government of the Kyrgyz Republic of the Protocol on accession of the Kyrgyz Republic to the Marrakesh Agreement on the establishment of the World Trade Organization and study of ongoing work to stimulate the export of national products within the framework of the EU's GSP+ trade preferences provided to the Kyrgyz Republic. This step also demonstrates an increased interest on part of the deputies' sector on opportunities and obligations of the Kyrgyz Republic within the framework of GSP + status. The Chairman of the Committee, the deputy of the Parliament of the Kyrgyz Republic, I. Pirmatov expressed his interest in the work of the Coalition and took part in the Forum on December 13, 2019. Due to the fact that the Government of the Kyrgyz Republic is accountable to the Parliament of the Kyrgyz Republic there is a high probability that the activities of state bodies within the framework of GSP+ will move to a more active phase of implementation, which will also have a positive effect on ensuring the labor rights of beneficiaries in the framework of the obligations assumed by Kyrgyzstan.
- In the framework of the conducted round tables, trainings, seminars and the Forum, government officials, representatives of the Ombudsman's office, representatives of local authorities took part in the discussions and became aware of the issues raised in the alternative reports. The data presented in the framework of this project can help the wider civil society to highlight these underappreciated problems, as well as attract the attention of decision-makers who can influence the resolution of these problems.
- One of the factors that can be mentioned as the project results is the interest of partner organizations in actualization of labor rights, in particular, of women, and participation of the project coordinator Ch. Babaliev with a report on women's labor rights at the round table "International Standards and Gender Equality in the Employment Sector" (December 6 2019) and at the seminar on the theme "Gender discrimination at the workplace" (December 7) at the invitation of the Forum of women deputies of the Kyrgyz Republic organized in cooperation with the Kyrgyzstan's Office of the American Center of International labor union solidarity (Solidarity Center). The two-day events were timed to coincide with a global campaign to promote the rights and opportunities of women, to eradicate violence against women and girls in Kyrgyzstan. The main goal of the events is to consolidate all responsible and interested parties in promoting issues of gender equality and the prevention of gender discrimination.

## Work Plan and Logframe

*Please attach separately the most recent and updated work plan and logframe for the entire duration of the project. If applicable, please also share the latest version of your Communications and Visibility Plan and/or your Monitoring Plan.*

The latest Updated and agreed work plan was previously sent from DRI on 6/11/2019

### 5. Communication and Visibility

*Please list what kind of communication and visibility activities have been conducted (for external communication through internet, please add links). If activities have been reported by media, please list the articles titles with dates. If available, attach separately a sample of event photos, social media posts, procurement documents, etc which show this visibility.*

In the course of the implementation of the entire project the Coalition ensured visibility of the project in accordance with the EU Guidelines (COMMUNICATION AND VISIBILITY MANUAL for European Union External Actions). All developed informational materials, articles, video clips, video graphics, infographics, publications, press releases were published on the Coalition's website and on social media pages and comply with the EU requirements. The informational materials were coordinated with the EU Delegation to the Kyrgyz Republic; in publications there is a disclaimer designated by the EU.

On January 30, 2020, a press conference was held as part of the project. At the press conference, information was provided to the public about the existing problems in the field of labor rights, which have been identified during the preparation of an alternative reports on observation of labor rights of women and children in the Kyrgyz Republic. Draft alternative reports were printed and presented at a press conference to media representatives. A representative of the partner organization took part in a press-conference - Eldiyar Karachalov – chairman of the Youth Council of the Federation of Labor Unions of the Kyrgyz Republic, the director of PF "Foundation for Support of labor initiatives" and a member of the Public Observation Council of the State Ecological Technical Inspection, who also participated in the development of alternative reports. Links:

<http://coalition.kg/2020/01/15/parava-cheloveka/>

<https://www.facebook.com/coalitionkg/posts/3280383765308503?>

<http://presscenter.akipress.org/news:28357/>

<https://kg.akipress.org/news:1593588/?from=kgnews&place=maincats>

[https://24.kg/obschestvo/142100\\_vkyirgyizstane\\_net\\_bazyi\\_podetyam\\_vovlechennyim\\_vnaihudshie\\_formy\\_i\\_truda/](https://24.kg/obschestvo/142100_vkyirgyizstane_net_bazyi_podetyam_vovlechennyim_vnaihudshie_formy_i_truda/)

<https://regnum.ru/news/polit/2844485.html>

Also, in the framework of the project, in January 2020, articles on the labor rights of women and children were prepared and posted, links:

<https://www.facebook.com/coalitionkg/posts/3280394145307465?>

[https://www.facebook.com/coalitionkg/posts/3344064655607080?\\_tn\\_ =K-R](https://www.facebook.com/coalitionkg/posts/3344064655607080?_tn_ =K-R)



More detailed information with links to articles is indicated in the Communication Plan of the project (in the attachment).

**6. List of Attached Documents**

**Final Narrative Report**

**Communication Plan**